

Public Consultation on the proposed closure of Panmure St Ann's Special School

This paper sets out the Council's proposal to commence a consultation process to close Panmure St Ann's Special School which offers secondary school places to young people from stages S3-S6.

This proposal reflects the Council's Vision for Schools that are effective in meeting the diverse needs of their communities. Through continuing improvement in school ethos, the curriculum, inclusive practice and partnership working almost all learners in Edinburgh now have their needs met in mainstream schools, which has resulted in a reduced requirement for placements in special schools for learners with additional social, emotional and behaviour support needs (SEBN). The population in the secondary special school provision has fallen from 112 to 55 over the past five years.

In the light of these changes, the Council now proposes that Panmure St Ann's should close with the needs of the small number of 6 young people who would remain on the school roll met more effectively through tailored, individual packages to enable them to complete their final stage of statutory school education within a mainstream school or, where appropriate, at Gorgie Mills Special School for secondary learners with social, emotional and behaviour support needs.

The document also explains the consultation process and the timescales for representations and decisions.

The paper has been issued by the City of Edinburgh Council for consultation in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.

Contents	Page
1. Introduction	3
2. Summary of the proposal	4
3. Panmure St Ann's Special School – Case for closure	6
4. Educational Benefits Statement	9
5. Equality Statement	23
6. Personnel/Staffing	23
7. Travel and Transport	24
8. Financial implications	24
9. Conclusion	25
10. Consultation Process	26

Appendix 1 Panmure St Ann's Special School: Site plan

Appendix 2 Panmure St Ann's Special School: Location map

Introduction

- 1.1 It is a priority for the Council to provide high quality care and learning for children and young people and wherever possible to make effective provision within their own communities and schools within the City of Edinburgh. This is consistent with the legal obligation in favour of the 'presumption of mainstream' which maintains the right of all children and young people to be educated alongside their peers in mainstream schools, unless there are exceptional reasons in law for not doing so (Standards in Scotland's Schools Etc. Act 2000). For learners who require a special school environment the Council offers a wide range of provision in special schools and classes.
- 1.2 Our aim is that as far as is possible, personal or social circumstances such as gender, ethnic origin or family background are not obstacles to learners achieving educational outcomes in Edinburgh's schools. Continuing progress in the presumption of mainstream is supported by the inclusive nature of Curriculum for Excellence and the National Improvement Framework priorities for school education.
- 1.3 We are committed to the continued strengthening of high quality inclusive provision, enabling proportionate support for learners and effective measures to address additional support needs. We prioritise wellbeing for all young people and the development of skills for learning, life and work and the best possible post-school destination.
- 1.4 The Council's Vision for Schools¹ was approved by the Education, Children and Families Committee on 8 October 2013 and updated in March 2015. The Vision for Schools recognises that where additional support is required it is most effective when it is built on a foundation of strong universal provision.
- 1.5 The Council's school priorities 2016-19, reflect those of the Scottish Government National Improvement Framework²
 - Improvement in children and young people's attainment/achievement, particularly in literacy and numeracy.
 - Closing the attainment gap between the most and least disadvantaged children and young people.
 - Improvement in children and young people's health and wellbeing.
 - Improvement in employability skills and sustained, positive school leaver destinations for all young people.

¹ http://www.edinburgh.gov.uk/meetings/meeting/3616/education_children_and_families_committee

² <http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Education/Schools/NationalImprovementFramework>

1.6 In 2010 we adopted a three-phase redesign strategy for additional support needs:

Phase 1 Strengthening universal provision in our schools, this continues as a key element of the improvement strategy.

Phase 2 Integrating assessment and support for Additional Support Needs within a wider approach to supporting children in need (Getting It Right for Every Child), including the introduction of a single child's plan and streamlining access to support.

Phase 3 Enhancing collaborative networks of support within and around schools and school clusters. This includes cluster teams, Educational Psychologists, an Additional Support for Learning service team, Social Work teams, NHS and other partners. A procurement framework will provide a range of supports and extended opportunities for learners through a range of partnership services to schools and learners.

1.7 There is good evidence³ that generally, where learners with additional social, emotional and behaviour support needs are supported in mainstream settings, they achieve better outcomes. Through continuing improvement in school ethos, the curriculum inclusive practice and partnership working almost all learners with additional social, emotional and behaviour support needs in Edinburgh now have their needs met in mainstream schools. This will be further enhanced by ongoing and inclusive practice review for secondary schools which includes head teachers and other key partners.

1.8 As part of phase 3 of this strategy the proposal is to close Panmure St Ann's Special School and to further enhance inclusive provision through tailored programmes to meet individual needs in mainstream settings where appropriate.

2. Summary of Proposal

2.1 The proposal to close Panmure St Ann's Special School reflects:

- progress achieved in providing effective inclusive support in mainstream schools
- improving capacity to deliver enhanced services for young people with additional social, emotional and behaviour support needs through

³ (Restrictive educational placements increase adolescent risks for students with early-starting conduct problems. Powers CJ1, Bierman KL2, Coffman DL3. Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry 2016 Aug; 57(8):899-908).

individual programmes and partner support within local mainstream schools

- continued enhancement of provision at Gorgie Mills Special School for young people who may continue to require a special secondary school placement.

2.2 Subject to the Scottish Government's statutory school closure process, it is proposed that Panmure St Ann's Special School would close at the end of June 2017. The closure would take effect on a planned and phased basis taking account the needs of young people.

Table 1: Panmure St Ann's falling school roll 2016-17

August 2016	January 2017	August 2017
14	6	Likely 0

- 2.3 Despite the high levels of commitment of the Panmure St Ann's staff, a school of 6 learners cannot provide the range and quality of curricular experience that young people require in order to prepare them for adult life and the world of work. It was concluded, therefore, that it would be preferable to offer learners a positive alternative which actively promotes their personal and social development and educational progress.
- 2.4 Accordingly, it is proposed that the 6 learners who are on the roll of Panmure St Ann's in January 2017 will transition to other schools with individual packages of support to complete their school education. Four of the 6 remaining learners are June 2017 school leavers with the remaining 2 being December 2017 leavers and therefore it is anticipated that there will be no learners on the roll at Panmure St Ann's Special School by August 2017. Given these circumstances it is proposed to close Panmure St Ann's at the end of the school session in June 2017.
- 2.5 To enable continuity in their individual progression, it is planned that the remaining 6 learners will either join the roll of a mainstream secondary school or Gorgie Mills Special School prior to June 2017 with programmes tailored to meet their individual needs. Extensive individual support for these learners is in place and they are all actively engaged in preparations for transitions and towards positive destinations for school/college partnership and/or intensive support from JET⁴.

⁴ (Job, Education and Training) Academy, as part of the Edinburgh Guarantee (<https://www.edinburghguarantee.org>).

- 2.6 Maintaining the current provision, i.e. keeping Panmure St Ann's Special School open, is not specifically given as an option in this consultation, but the Council could decide on this course of action if deemed appropriate as a result of the consultation.

3. Panmure St Ann's Special School – Case for closure

Capacity, school roll and referrals

- 3.1 Panmure St Ann's Special School was originally developed as an educational and social work service, for young people of secondary school age experiencing significant social, emotional and behavioural difficulties. Young people attended Panmure St Ann's on a part-time basis whilst they remained on the register of their host mainstream school. However, in practice this meant that almost all learners did not access their entitlement to full-time school education of 190 days and 27.5 hours of education. Meanwhile, as it was not recognised as a school, the Panmure St Ann's service was not part of the national school inspection framework. To address these concerns, following a review Panmure St Ann's was formally recognised as a special school offering full-time school education from S3 to S6 in August 2013.
- 3.2 Placement at any of Edinburgh's special schools is managed through the Council's Case Management Review Group (CMRG). This process enables both school and family/community support to be tailored to need and delivered in a single package following the principles of Getting It Right for Every Child (GIRFEC)⁵ In this way, the child's right to a mainstream education is protected and, where exceptional circumstances require it, special school placements are agreed.
- 3.3 Since this approach was introduced, in 2010, there has been a very significant shift in favour of meeting the needs, and organizing extensive and appropriate provision, for children and young people who require additional social, emotional and behavioural support needs in mainstream schools. Consequently, the number of referrals of children and young people to the CMRG for placements in secondary and primary special schools for SEBN, have reduced substantially.
- 3.4 In 2010, the pupil population in Rowanfield, the city's only primary special school for social, emotional and behavioural support needs, was 59. Two years following the introduction of the case management approach, in 2013/14 the school population had been progressively reduced to around 30 pupils. Over the same period, a programme of improvements in Rowanfield Special School has significantly enhanced the quality of provision. This too is reflected in a shift in number of learners who successfully progress from Rowanfield back into a

⁵ <http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/Young-People/gettingitright/what-is-girfec>
Page 6 of 28

mainstream school as a result of the support provided. It has also enabled the school to support children with more complex needs who would have previously been placed in provision outside the authority.

- 3.5 This approach has led to a fall in demand for special school placements in primary which is now impacting on secondary provision. The sustained reduction in referrals has had a significant impact on Panmure St Ann's school roll. As more young people leave Panmure St Ann's Special School, new starts have remained very low, leading to a consistent fall in the school's roll as learner's leave school (Table 2). In recent years the overall population in the secondary special school provision at Gorgie Mills Special School and Panmure St Ann's Special School has fallen from a high of 112 to 55.

Table 2: Special School Placements for social, emotional and behavioural support needs, 2013-17

Special School/Year	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	Jan 2017
<i>Primary - Rowanfield</i>	33	31	28	23	32
<i>Secondary</i>					
Gorgie Mills	55	53	53	46	51
Panmure St Ann's	57	43	26	14	4
Secondary Total	112	96	79	60	55
Total	145	127	107	83	87

- 3.6 Following reductions in the school roll at Rowanfield Special School the number of referrals for special school placements at P7-S1 for learners with additional social, emotional and behaviour support needs is now only 2-4 placements per year. Gorgie Mills Special School will continue to provide secondary special school placements for learners with social, emotional and behaviour support needs similar to Panmure St Ann's. Gorgie Mills has a capacity of 72 places and by January 2017 it will have around 51 learners on its roll.
- 3.7 In light of this changing pattern of need the authority has concluded that despite the commitment of the staff, by the end of the 2016/17 school session, Panmure St Ann's Special School will be no longer viable as a school by August 2017 as there would be only 2 leavers by then on the school roll. In addition, in view of the remaining capacity at Gorgie Mills the proposed closure of Panmure St Ann's would not compromise the authority's provision for special school

placements for secondary age learners with social, emotional and behaviour support needs where required.

- 3.8 In addition to the fall in the pupil population, the nature and quality of the education at Panmure St Ann's Special School has fundamental shortcomings, as highlighted in the Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report published April 2016⁶. These challenges have become more acute following the decline of the school roll. With such a small pupil population both the breadth of curriculum subjects and the viability of the learning community is compromised.
- 3.9 In addition, there are significant shortcomings in the school environment which have been taken into account in this proposal. Panmure St Ann's School is located in the Cowgate area of the city in a 19th century listed building with no supervised outside space within the perimeter of the school. As a consequence the school is restricted in its ability to provide the necessary learning environment to deliver the full curriculum. By contrast, Gorgie Mills is located in premises that were purpose built for a secondary SEBN special school in 2008 with good outdoor space including an all-weather sports pitch.
- 3.10 At the end of 2015, in light of the above, the conclusion was reached by Council officers that Panmure St Ann's Special School is no longer required and that in future it would be more appropriate to make provision for this population of young people within mainstream provision and where appropriate at Gorgie Mills Special School. The principal reasons for this conclusion were:
- There is good evidence that mainstream provision is likely to achieve better outcomes for learners and is consistent with the duty to secure best value and the presumption of mainstream.
 - There are fundamental shortcomings in the nature and quality of the education provided in the Panmure St Ann's Special School.
 - The school continues to operate significantly below capacity, which compromises its educational viability and results in exceptionally high per capita costs.
 - Education Scotland's Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report published in April 2016 highlighted multiple areas for improvement in both attainment and learners' experiences at Panmure St Ann's Special School.
 - The building and has proved poorly suited to hosting a modern school education.

⁶ <https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>
Page 8 of 28

Proposed alternative provision

- 3.11 The proposed closure would not require changes to be made to existing secondary catchment areas as special school placements are allocated on a city-wide basis.
- 3.12 More suitable alternative provision which in summary includes enhancing universal provision with networks of support; reinvesting £200k per annum of the savings from closing Panmure St Ann's into additional support for secondary aged learners with social, emotional and behaviour support needs.

4. Educational Benefits Statement

- 4.1 The educational benefits for learners who require additional support for social, emotional and behavioural needs are at the heart of the 3-phase strategy (see **Section 1.6**) that has enabled us to propose this closure.
- 4.2 The main benefits this strategy has delivered are:
- additional support needs are met earlier and more effectively
 - improvements in inclusive practice within schools builds capacity to the benefit of the wider school population
 - by remaining in mainstream settings learners have more equitable access to wider opportunities and better outcomes
 - strengthening of supports available to schools allows a wider population to benefit from more flexible use of resources that would otherwise remain tied up in running special school provision
 - focusing support around schools allows the nurturing of local resources and networks, fostering more resilient communities
 - investing in the continuing improvement of provision for the small number of learners who continue to require a special school environment
 - enabling best use of resources and best value.
- 4.3 These benefits, which have been evidenced in local practice as the strategy has unfolded, are consistent with authoritative international research⁷.

The findings of this longitudinal study followed a large sample of children from the early years to outcomes in high school, indicate that '*although intended to benefit students, restrictive placements may exacerbate the maladjustment of youth with conduct problems' and lead to poorer outcomes*'. The study concludes:

⁷ Restrictive educational placements increase adolescent risks for students with early-starting conduct problems. Powers CJ1, Bierman KL2, Coffman DL3. Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry 2016 Aug; 57(8):899-908

‘To avoid harm to students and to society, schools must find alternatives to restrictive placements for students with conduct problems in secondary school, particularly when these students do not have cognitive impairments that might warrant specialized educational supports.’

- 4.4 The Council has carefully considered the timing of the closure and concluded that there would be greater benefit in closing the school in June 2017, rather than attempting to operate a school with a very small number of pupils for the 2017-18 school session. It is proposed that it would be preferable to offer all learners a positive alternative which both provides an opportunity for learners to receive their full educational entitlement and promotes young people’s personal and social development and educational progress.
- 4.5 The Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report⁸ highlighted a number of areas for improvement in the attainment and learning experience for young people attending Panmure St Ann’s. The evaluations of the five quality indicators are shown in Table 3 below.

Table 3: HMIE Inspection quality indicators – Panmure St Ann’s School

Quality Indicator	2013-2014	2014-2015	HMIE April 2016
Improvements in performance	3 -Satisfactory	3 - Satisfactory	3 - Satisfactory
Learners’ experiences	4 – Good	4 - Good	3 - Satisfactory
Meeting learning needs	4 – Good	4 - Good	3 - Satisfactory
The curriculum	3 - Satisfactory	4 - Good	2 - Weak
Improvement through self evaluation	2 – Weak	3 - Satisfactory	2 - Weak

- 4.6 The HMIE recommendations for improvement following the inspection included:
1. As a matter of priority, take steps to improve young people’s attendance and timekeeping.
 2. Increase expectations of young people’s attainment and achievement.
 3. Develop the curriculum in line with national guidance to ensure young people receive their full entitlements to a broad general education and senior phase.
 4. Take a more rigorous approach to self-evaluation and tracking young people’s progress.

⁸ Published April 2016 (<https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>)
Page 10 of 28

After carefully profiling learner's individual needs, we assessed that, with the benefits of careful personalised planning and assured supports, the remaining learners would benefit from alternative placements. Our conclusion is that for existing pupils, the risk of continuing to attend the school with a depleted population, poor levels of attendance and a restricted range of facilities/ opportunities outweigh any risk of a change of placement.

4.7 In future, most learners with social and emotional needs will benefit from inclusive provision in mainstream offering wider opportunities and higher standards in terms of educational outcomes. More detailed evidence for this assessment are set out below with regard to:

- **Educational outcomes (Improvements in performance)**
- **Quality of education (Learners' experiences; meeting learning needs; Curriculum)**

Educational outcomes

4.8 All schools in Edinburgh gather and analyse data to evaluate improvements in performance on an annual basis. This includes national qualifications, attendance and exclusions. This process allows each school to identify trends and work with Council officers to reach an evaluation of overall performance and plan improvements.

4.9 In assessing educational outcomes for Panmure St Ann's, attainment in National Qualifications, positive destinations, attendance and exclusions were all considered. Data from the Scottish Government's 'Insight' benchmarking tool for secondary schools with learners in the senior phase (S4 to S6) was used to evaluate outcomes. As Panmure St Ann's was only registered as a school from August 2013, data from 2014/15 was used to enable a clear comparison to all secondary schools.

4.10 Almost all of the population of learners who would in past years possible have attended Panmure St Ann's Special School are being supported in mainstream schools. Accordingly, as the alternative provision for almost all future learners is in mainstream, we have compared outcomes for Panmure St Ann's with outcomes in mainstream provision.

4.11 The Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) is a Scottish Government tool used to determine areas of multiple deprivation to aid planning, targeting resources and self evaluation. As learners attending Panmure St Ann's are more

likely to come from backgrounds with higher levels of deprivation than average, this has been taken into account for purposes of comparison.

4.12 Data for Panmure St Ann’s is considered alongside a high school serving an area of high socio-economic deprivation (low SIMD) and the city average. The data indicates that Panmure St Ann’s has 50% of learners in SIMD 1 and 2 (and 68% in 1 to 3), compared to Craigroyston Community High School with 73% in SIMD 1 and 2 (and 80% in 1 to 3). We can see therefore that Craigroyston has an even greater proportion of learners in SIMD 1 and 2 than Panmure St Ann’s (73% compared to 50%). As we will go on to describe, Craigroyston is achieving better outcomes for learners than Panmure St Ann’s despite a more deprived population.

Table 4: Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) Percentage of Pupils on the school roll in each Decile (Decile 1: most deprived area; Decile 10: least deprived area)

School(s)	SIMD Deciles										Total Roll (No. of pupils)
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	
Panmure St Ann’s	24%	26%	18%	13%	3%	0%	3%	5%	3%	5%	38
Craigroyston Community High School	47%	26%	7%	5%	11%	3%	0%	0%	0%	0%	473
City of Edinburgh	12%	7%	8%	6%	6%	8%	7%	8%	11%	27%	18,163

Attainment in National Qualifications

4.13 All Scottish educational qualifications are given national tariff points which are used to determine entry requirements for further education. The number of national tariff points determines a learner’s options in progression routes to the world of work and further education. The higher the level of course studied, the higher the tariff points awarded to the learner. National 4 awards are used as the minimum benchmark for pupils to enable them to access college courses however Panmure St Ann’s currently only offers National 3 awards.

4.14 Learners currently attending Panmure St Ann’s are presented for lower level qualifications than their peers in Craigroyston Community High school and other City of Edinburgh secondary schools (which offer National 3, 4 and above) and as a result Panmure St Ann’s learners are likely be disadvantaged by not being offered a wider range of study opportunities. In addition, learners at Panmure St Ann’s did not all receive full course awards, with only some units completed.

4.15 At all levels the achievement of Panmure St Ann’s’ learners is significantly below average for the city and in comparison with achievement at Craigroyston

Community High School. There is also very limited opportunity at Panmure St Ann's for learner progression to higher level qualifications, which is a constraint on young people's opportunities to progress. Attainment data relating to relative performance in National Qualifications in courses for 2014-2015 is summarised in Table 5.

Table 5: Attainment in National Qualifications: S4 young people 2014-15

% of S4 Achieving:	Panmure	Craigroyston HS	Craigroyston HS (LAC* Pupils)	City Average
National 4 Numeracy	4%	56%	50%	87%
National 4 Literacy	20%	82%	75%	91%
One or more SCQF level 3 Course Awards (at least qualification at National 3 or above)	52%	94%	88%	97%
One or more SCQF level 4 Course Awards (at least one qualification at National 4 or above)	52%	89%	88%	95%

Note

*LAC Pupils: The Council provides a range of care options for looked after and accommodated young people based on their needs.

4.16 Attainment in National Qualifications, in both course awards and unit awards, is significantly higher and more broadly based in the comparator mainstream school above (in Table 5) than in Panmure St Ann's. The established trend in favour of the presumption of mainstream offers significant benefits in terms of the range of opportunities for study and levels of attainment for learners.

4.17 In Panmure St Ann's the course awards offered are more restricted due to the small number of pupils, staffing and the accommodation. In 2015/16 learners were offered a choice of 5 course awards, including English and Mathematics, mainly at National 3 level, with units mainly being achieved. In almost all CEC mainstream schools a range of 6-8 full National course awards is offered from National 3 to National 5 in S4, with progression to Higher possible in most subjects and to Advanced Higher in some subjects. There were no learners from Panmure St Ann's who gained qualification at National 5, whereas the city average is 86%.

- 4.18 The underachievement of young people who attend Panmure St Ann's was noted in the Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report⁹ when improvements in performance (i.e. attainment and achievement), of young people was evaluated as weak. In their Report, Education Scotland concluded: *'...there are more weaknesses within this aspect of the school's work. While there may be some strengths, the important weaknesses, either individually or collectively, are sufficient to diminish learners' experiences in substantial ways. It implies the need for prompt, structured and planned action on the part of the school'*.
- 4.19 With the falling roll at Panmure St Ann's it is proposed that the remaining 6 learners from Panmure St Ann's, all of whom are currently in S4, will transfer to alternative provision and will be supported via bespoke personalised learning programmes, with opportunities to progress their attainment and achievement within a wider range of options to reflect individual interests and strengths. In particular, they will benefit from being involved in relevant college provision and relevant work experience where they develop their skills for life and work where appropriate.
- 4.20 Accessing alternative schools allows for greater opportunities for progression in these pupils' learning and they will be able to receive far more accreditation opportunities for their wider successes and achievements.

Positive Destinations

- 4.21 Post school destination is one of the main measures used by the Scottish Government as part of the implementation of the National Improvement Framework to determine how well schools are doing at closing the attainment gap. In March 2015 positive destinations for Edinburgh's school leavers was 92.3% overall (88% for Craigroyston). Special schools overall were at 57.6%, whereas only 50% of leavers from Panmure St Ann's were successful in securing a positive destination. There is therefore an immediate concern to secure better opportunities for the current cohort of 6 learners from Panmure St Ann's.
- 4.22 To address this increased provision has already been put in place since August 2016 to support Panmure St Ann's pupils this year through enhanced Council provision i.e. through JET (Job Education and Training) programmes, business mentoring and work with other business partners on a continuing basis.
- 4.23 In almost all mainstream schools, there are high quality learning experiences developed through many partnerships which enhance the overall quality of education, thus improving outcomes for all learners and raising attainment and achievement.

⁹ Published April 2016 (<https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>)
Page 14 of 28

4.24 In mainstream schools there are many partnerships already existing and these partnerships are available to support learners from Panmure St Ann's in mainstream and to help raise attainment and achievement. Many of these partnerships with local businesses have been built up around the vocational studies and the Panmure St Ann's learners will benefit from these. Another educational benefit for the Panmure St Ann's learners will be increased opportunity to learn in the community, as most of the mainstream schools have good access to quality community facilities which increase course range and accreditation, raising attainment and achievement. These opportunities support positive and sustainable post school destinations for all. For the few learners for whom a mainstream setting is not appropriate, Gorgie Mills Special School offers a purpose built environment and support which enables learners' personalised programmes, (e.g. work experience and college placements) to be sustained and developed.

Attendance and Exclusions

4.25 The Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report¹⁰ identified that as a matter of priority the school needed to *'take steps to improve young peoples' attendance and timekeeping'* p3.

4.26 Attendance at Panmure St Ann's for the school session 2015/16 was 72.44%; whilst this is similar to comparable special schools it is well below the City of Edinburgh average in mainstream schools, which was 92.51%. The overall attendance figures for 2014-16 are shown below in Table 6 below. Once again, despite its profile of higher deprivation, Craigmoynton has significantly higher levels of attendance than Panmure.

Table 6: Panmure St Ann's School and Mainstream Comparators

Attendance	2014/15	2105/16
Panmure St Ann's Special School	71.76%	72.44%
Gorgie Mills Special school	69.75%	71.30%
Craigmoynton Community High School	89.96%	90.31%
All mainstream Secondary Schools	92.54%	92.51%

4.27 Continued low attendance at Panmure St Ann's Special School is impacting on learning and teaching. After periods of absence pupils have to catch up on work missed in class; this also slows down the pace of their own learning and that of other pupils. A similar pattern applies at Gorgie Mills Special School; in response to which a targeted programme is now underway to improve attendance at both schools.

¹⁰ Published April 2016 (<https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>)
Page 15 of 28

4.28 One factor influencing the level of attendance at Panmure St Ann's is the limited access to the appropriate curriculum in line with Curriculum for Excellence. If learners do not find the curriculum sufficiently challenging and stimulating in depth, breadth, coherence, relevance, challenge and enjoyment they are likely to feel less motivated to attend school and engage in learning. The inspectors concluded that the curriculum at Panmure St Ann's was weak. There are many factors impacting on this, including the size of the school and the inflexibility of the school accommodation.

4.29 Many of the subjects and courses which would motivate the Panmure St Ann's learners to attend school, e.g. vocational studies, are not offered on the curriculum because of Panmure's restricted facilities, range of expertise and partnerships. Diminishing numbers and poor attendance has resulted in very restricted levels of social interaction with peers in lessons and in particular a significantly adverse impact on group discussion and appreciating other view points. In addition many learners at Panmure St Ann's would benefit from a larger group of peers and teachers for interaction and friendship opportunities, along with a stronger and more relevant curriculum to provide greater opportunities to lead in their learning.

Quality of education

Curriculum and learners experiences and supporting learners to progress

4.30 Young people have a more restricted curriculum at Panmure St Ann's in comparison with other special schools and all other secondary mainstream schools, some of which is due to the building and its city centre location. In particular:

- There are no CDT facilities; pupils are required to be taken by bus to physical education facilities and CDT in mainstreams schools, resulting in a loss of time for teaching and learning.
- The lack of provision of outdoor and indoor sports facilities has a major impact on all learners as very few receive their entitlement to fulfil two hours quality physical education per week.
- Classroom facilities are limited and much of the school accommodation is inflexible and not easily adapted to meet the requirements of a modern curriculum developing skills for life, learning and work.
- There is a limited range of subjects offered in the Senior Phase and the building is the major contributor to this.
- Most mainstream schools have embedded digital learning in supporting young people to prepare for life beyond school. Although ipads have been purchased and staff trained in the use of digital technology this is not being used by consistently by staff to improve the learner's experience.

- Almost all mainstream secondary schools offer vocational studies for example: hairdressing, painting and decorating, gardening, hospitality and in some, car mechanics. There is no opportunity for learners to take part in vocational studies due to the restrictive nature of the school accommodation at Panmure St Ann's. Any learner needing to access these opportunities in a mainstream school has to travel there from Panmure St Ann's, resulting in a loss of time for teaching and learning.
- 4.31 The 6 remaining learners on the Panmure St Ann's Special School roll as of January 2017 will have individualised educational packages provided for them in conjunction with mainstream school placements or at Gorgie Mills Special School, if required. This will ensure that pupils continue to progress in their learning. Learners will have the opportunity to continue with their National qualifications and, where appropriate, to progress to next levels or to continue to develop their skills for learning, life and work.
- 4.32 The vocational courses in mainstream schools are certificated up to National 5 level. This level of qualification prepares learners well for apprenticeships, college or the world of work. Through the proposed alternative of mainstream placements the 6 learners at Panmure St Ann's will have full access to these opportunities, currently unavailable to these young people.
- 4.33 The transition to settings in mainstream, where appropriate, would provide the Panmure St Ann's learners with access to a wider and more diverse peer group, enhancing opportunities for collaborative learning and social interaction in groups and pairs. This would greatly improve the quality of learning experiences for these young people.
- 4.34 The quality of education in mainstream secondary schools or Gorgie Mills Special School would increase opportunities for learners to benefit from a broad, balanced, relevant and challenging curriculum especially in the Senior Phase (S4-S6). Learners at this stage on their learning journey would have the opportunity to build up their learning portfolio gaining SQA qualifications at appropriate levels as well as other awards such as The Duke of Edinburgh Award, JET programme, Saltire award, ASDAN, (via a range of courses covering preparation for life and work, enrichment subjects, PSHE and Citizenship).
- 4.35 The link between curriculum and national qualifications at this stage is of critical importance in the Senior Phase. For the remaining learners at Panmure St Ann's the move to another school to complete their Senior Phase would offer far more opportunities to build their portfolios and support them towards a positive and sustainable destination and continue to engage in learning beyond school.

- 4.36 Opportunities for further personalisation and choice at another school will build on each learner's strength and therefore educational experiences will be more relevant to the individual. Planned courses of study will reflect each learner's interests enabling opportunities for learners to study a greater range of courses and subjects than are currently offered at Panmure St Ann's.
- 4.37 The Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report published April 2016¹¹ evaluated support to learners as a weakness at Panmure St Ann's. In similar special schools, and overall in secondary mainstream schools, evaluations of the extent to which learners are supported to progress are at least 'good'. A key reason why Education Scotland evaluated Panmure St Ann's as 'weak' was the limited options in the curriculum, as learners are not receiving their entitlements to a modern, relevant and challenging curriculum.
- 4.38 In Edinburgh's schools generally, learning is very well planned, progression is evident, the pace of learning is well judged, the range of learning and teaching approaches are well monitored and overall the quality of learning and teaching is better and well measured. Learners also have many more opportunities to lead in their learning and receive high quality feedback during learning situations. All of these strengths will support Panmure St Ann's learners to achieve more and build their learning portfolios preparing for life beyond school if the proposed closure is implemented.
- 4.39 All mainstream secondary schools offer opportunities for young people to follow a coherent curriculum and in doing so increase the depth, breadth, and challenge of their educational experience. In all secondary mainstream schools there is a strong focus on ensuring that all learners receive their entitlements and their curriculum for S4-S6 provides opportunities for the continuation of study in discrete subject areas for National Qualifications.
- 4.40 In Edinburgh's mainstream secondary schools and in Gorgie Mills (the special school with the most similar profile to Panmure St Ann's) learning opportunities are better, young people are achieving and school accommodation is better suited to learning. Gorgie Mills Special School is a relatively new, purpose built special school with a larger roll than Panmure St Ann's and is therefore able to offer a wider choice of curriculum, both in terms of courses and levels.
- 4.41 By transferring to alternative provision in Edinburgh's schools to conclude their Senior Phase, learners from Panmure St Ann's will benefit from an increased range of opportunities to choose subjects and courses at appropriate levels. Planned learner pathways will take into account individual abilities and future destinations, while making space for wider achievement and providing scope for taking qualifications over differing timescales.

¹¹ (<https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>)
Page 18 of 28

Morale

4.42 Overall the morale in Panmure St Ann's is understandably low; pupils would benefit from learning in a more positive ethos with access to a wider range of opportunities and higher expectations of achievement and attainment.

4.43 Other users of the school

There are no other users of Panmure St Ann's School. There has been no placement of a young person from any other authority since Panmure St Ann's became a school in August 2013.

Future users of the school

4.44 The proposal to close Panmure St Ann's School reflects the progress achieved in strengthening universal provision in our schools, integrating assessment and support those learners with Additional Support Needs within a wider approach to supporting children in need and enhancing collaborative networks of support within and around schools and school clusters.

4.45 The continuing development of high quality inclusive provision has enabled proportionate support for learners and effective measures to address additional support needs in mainstream schools. This has led to a sustained trend away from referrals for specialist provision and generally achieving better outcomes. In this context there is no requirement for the continuation of Panmure St Ann's provision for social, emotional and behaviour support needs as such needs could be met at Gorgie Mills Special School which has available capacity for future learners.

Other schools in our Authority

4.46 The reduction in pupil numbers at Panmure St Ann's, from 43 in 2014/15 to 6 in January 2017 is largely due to early intervention and the increasing capacity of the mainstream schools to meet these needs. The current proposals will enhance this capacity further via an additional investment of £200,000 per annum of the savings from closing Panmure St Ann's from April 2018; this will supplement the current investment of £500,000 per annum in Inclusion monies to ensure long-term support to future learners.

4.47 Whilst there has been a significant decline in the Panmure St Ann's population the population of Gorgie Mills Special School remains at an average of just over 50, well below its capacity of 72. Accordingly, with this available capacity, it is not anticipated that there will be any adverse impact on provision at Gorgie Mills. In future we anticipate that enhanced provision in mainstream will increase the options available to future learners at Gorgie Mills.

4.48 The transition of the remaining 6 learners to suitable alternative schools is principally an opportunity to improve their opportunities and outcomes. However, we recognise that any transition also brings its own element of uncertainty for the learners and their parents/carers and this will be reflected in the young people's individual support plans. We will also provide the receiving schools with the assurance that this will not stretch their existing resources. Accordingly, Panmure St Ann's pupils will have appropriate additional staffing and /or resources to provide support to them as required.

Supports in mainstream schools

4.49 A wider range of resources currently available in mainstream schools for supporting learners include:

- Secondary school staff teams comprising Support for Pupils and Support for Learning
- Young Person's planning that ensures educational attainment is measured and included in plans
- Learning bases in most secondary schools
- A proven literacy programme which supports improvement in reading in pupils and access to the curriculum
- Community Learning and Development partnership working
- Youth Work to support positive engagement in learning
- Education Welfare Service – support to schools, children and their families
- Psychological Services
- Additional Support for Learning (ASL) Services
- School Health Services
- Support from Social Work services (where appropriate)
- Support from commissioned voluntary sector services, other voluntary sector and community organisations
- School Link Officers form a partnership between police and education

4.50 A number of initiatives are currently underway to support further improvement in additional support for Secondary school learners including:

- An increased focus on collaborative working through cluster teams,
- A pathway of support for learners with Emotionally-Based School Refusal issues and anxiety, particularly among adolescents.
- The development of a Virtual Learning Environment, to support learners unable to attend school for health reasons, or due to family circumstances.
- School Support for Learning leaders are working with the ASL Service and Psychological Services to lead in the implementation of the CIRCLE resource for inclusive practice with all teachers across the authority.

- The Growing Confidence programme includes staff training to support children’s mental and emotional well-being alongside the resource Supporting Young People Guide. This aims to raise awareness and understanding of the reasons behind children’s behaviour, how staff can respond empathically and better support young people with the difficulties they may be facing. The team also offer complementary support for parents (Raising Teens with Confidence) and peer education programmes (Cool, Calm & Connected) for young people.
- Other supports that are being rolled out include the NHS Mental Health First Aid training, Rights Respecting Schools and 1 in 5: Raising Awareness of Child Poverty Work, highlighting how best we can support young people to fulfil their potential.
- A resilience and role models programme ‘Turn Your Life Around’ is under assessment where volunteers who struggled in school themselves (because of family circumstances – poverty/abuse/neglect) are being trained to speak to staff, pupils and families in order to increase awareness of the challenges facing many of our young people and how we can best help them to turn things around.

Exclusions

4.51 In 2015/16 the average rate of exclusion in City of Edinburgh mainstream schools was 3% compared with 45% for Panmure St Ann’s. In session 2014/15 the corresponding figures were an average rate 5% and 53.50% at Panmure St Ann’s. These calculations are based on the number of pupils excluded compared to number of pupils overall.

The Council’s assessment of the benefits and any likely adverse effects of the Proposal (if implemented)

Benefits

4.52 If the proposal is implemented there would be a number of identified benefits both for young people currently attending Panmure St Ann’s School and future learners. Young people will have access to a wider range of opportunities within schools that are well equipped to deliver the curriculum and are demonstrating high expectations for achievement and attainment. They will benefit from opportunities for an extended senior phase and extensive local partnerships between their schools, employers, and college and community resources.

4.53 For future learners the closure is the culmination of the latest phase in a strategic improvement programme. It is part of a process of building a progressive collaborative approach founded upon a shared vision and commitment to inclusive practice across the sector and partners. To complement this, we are currently undertaking a self-evaluation exercise with head teachers and key partners. This will consolidate a common vision, help

share effective practice, inform continuing improvement and enhance partnership working across schools, Edinburgh College and community partners.

4.54 Continued improvements in integrated programmes of school and family support for learners in mainstream schools will enable a wider population of children in need to benefit from the assurance that the right support is readily available. Furthermore, linking with more innovative social work practice in locality teams, will provide better integrated approaches to intervention and, where appropriate, intensive support preventing the need for learners to move schools. Enabling learners to sustain their placement in mainstream provision in this way is likely to further reduce the need for specialist provision in this area, releasing capacity for reinvestment in other areas.

4.55 The combined effect of these approaches to support positive outcomes (achievement, attainment and positive destinations) by enabling learners to benefit from effective supports through mainstream schools and their partners. This will contribute to achieving the Scottish Government's and the Authority's key priorities for schools 2016-19, which reflect those of the National Improvement Framework:

- Improvement in children and young people's attainment/achievement, particularly in literacy and numeracy.
- Closing the attainment gap between the most and least disadvantaged children and young people.
- Improvement in children and young people's health and wellbeing.
- Improvement in employability skills and sustained, positive school leaver destinations for all young people.

Transition arrangements and managing potential adverse effects of closure

4.56 We recognise that any transition is challenging for learners and their parents/carers and for staff; pupils and parents/carers may be concerned about how this will be managed. Engagement of young people, parents and staff in regular young people planning meetings will help to mitigate the risks and anxieties associated with this change.

4.57 There will be a phased approach to transition of the 6 remaining learners to their new schools and initially this will be targeted at specific areas of the curriculum that are of special interest; continuity of positive relationships will be provided by the Panmure St Ann's staff to support each of the 6 young people. Timescales for this will be on an individual basis and, where appropriate, early transition will be arranged. The CMRG, managed by the Depute Educational Psychologist, will continue to monitor the progress of the 6 Panmure St Ann's learners throughout

the transition until they finish their school education, to ensure that any support or interventions are addressed and implemented quickly and responsively in the best interests of these young people

5. Equality Statement

5.1 The Equality Act 2010 requires the Council to:

- Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other prohibited conduct
- Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a relevant protected characteristic and those who do not
- Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not

5.2 Protected characteristics include: Age, Disability, Gender Identity, Marriage/Civil Partnership, Pregnancy/Maternity, Race, Religion/Belief, Sex and Sexual Orientation.

5.3 The proposal to close Panmure St Ann's School will improve opportunities for pupils to attain a higher standard of education, to be fulfilled and stimulated intellectually and creatively, to develop skills for participation and to access education that meets individual needs.

5.4 Learners will have access to a broader range of courses in mainstream schools, more relevant learning experiences, and greater opportunity for increased personalisation with access to the senior phase as appropriate, all of which is expected to improve outcomes.

5.5 Special School provision from S1 to S5 will continue to be available at Gorgie Mills for any learners who may require specialist provision into the future.

5.6 An Equality and Rights Impact Assessment has commenced (and is available on request) but the views of the public are integral to its development and conclusion. All views gathered regarding the impact of the proposal on equality issues or on the rights of staff, pupils and others will be taken into account in the completion of this assessment.

6. Personnel/Staffing

6.1 As a result of the continuing reduction in the school roll at Panmure St Ann's School the management of the administrative and classroom support staff groups is underway in line with existing Council procedures.

6.2 Teaching staff resources are also currently being managed in light of the reducing school roll at Panmure St Ann's School, in line with the LNCT (Local Negotiating Committee for Teachers) process and Council procedures,

7. Travel and Transport

7.1 Most learners travel some distance to attend Panmure St Ann's School and its city centre location which can result in delays in starting the school day and prolonged journeys at the end of the day. Learners also experience additional disruption during the school day with the need travel across Edinburgh to access facilities and activities due to the lack of onsite provision within the Cowgate area of the city.

7.2 The proposal, if agreed, would be highly likely to reduce travel time for almost all learners leading to a more coherent educational experience provided for by more local provision.

8. Financial implications

8.1 The annual cost of services at Panmure St Ann's School is £1.1m to support a capacity of 54 pupils.

8.2 In the 2016/17 budget process, the Council approved savings of £900K based on the proposed closure. This consists of £225K in 2016/17 with a further £675K in 2017/18. Total savings are £1.1m per year with £900K in approved savings and re-investment of £200K in additional support.

Should the consultation conclude that Panmure St Ann's should not close, approved savings of £900K will not be achievable and alternative savings will have to be identified.

8.3 The table below sets out the forecast financial position for 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19 on the assumption Panmure St Ann's closes in June 2017.

	2016/17 £m	2017/18 £m	2018/19 £m
Budget at full capacity of 54 pupils	1.100	1.100	1.100
Approved savings (cumulative)	0.225	0.900	0.900
Residual budget	0.875	0.200	0.200
Cost to deliver services of reduced roll	0.705	0.145	0.000
Balance available for re-investment	0.170	0.055	0.200

The above costs do not include the impact of empty property rates or any costs associated with security or on-going maintenance at the site. Work is ongoing with the estates section on the future use of the premises and any costs will be identified at that stage.

In addition to the above figures, £38K of property costs and £34K of business support costs would also be saved, contributing to approved savings in these service areas.

- 8.4 At full capacity (54 young people) this equates to education costs per school place of £20,370 a year. The average cost of a mainstream secondary school place is £4,221 a year.

The cost of maintaining provision at Panmure St Ann's for a roll of 6 learners is £35,827 per learner.

Roll	Teaching Staff	Non Teaching Staff	Transport	Supplies and Services	3rd Party Costs	Total Budget	Cost per place
54	533,456	508,059	12,500	36,986	9,665	1,100,666	20,370
6	138,152	59,195	2,250	13,437	1,928	214,962	35,827

- 8.5 The reinvestment of £200K per annum from savings associated with the proposed closure would support individualised packages for pupils who need them in order to be educated in a mainstream school.
- 8.6 The Council will seek to re-deploy all affected staff at Panmure St Ann's School, however, should there be any early release costs these will be met through funding made available for the Council's transformation programme.

9. Conclusion

- 9.1 The rationale for the closure of Panmure St Ann's Special School can be summarised as follows:
- The reduced demand for special school placements has resulted in a reduction in referrals and an associated reduction in Panmure St Ann's school roll to the extent that by the end of the 2016/17 school session, it will be no longer viable as a school.
 - The school is restricted in its ability to provide the necessary learning environment to deliver the full curriculum.
 - Fundamental shortcomings in the nature and quality of the education provided in the Panmure St Ann's Special School became fully apparent once the service was required to fulfil all of the obligations of a school.

- Education Scotland's The Education Scotland HMIE School Inspection Report¹² highlighted multiple areas for improvement in both attainment and learning experience.
- The school's location within the original Cowgate building has proved poorly suited to hosting modern school education.
- The school continues to operate significantly below capacity, which compromises its educational viability and results in exceptionally high per capita costs compared to alternate provision.
- Travelling time for learners is a barrier to attendance, achievement and participation.
- There is good evidence that local, less restricted provision is likely to achieve better outcomes for learners and is consistent with the duty to secure best value.

10. Consultation Process

10.1 It is proposed to close Panmure St Ann's School at the end of the school year, 30 June 2017.

10.2 The Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 sets out the statutory consultation requirements. For the closure of Panmure St Ann's Special School; the statutory consultees include:

- Education Scotland
- Panmure St Ann's Special School:
 - The 6 learners at the school from January 2017 transitioning to other schools by August 2017
 - Parents /carers of the 6 remaining learners at Panmure St Ann's
 - School senior management team and staff at Panmure St Ann's
 - Staff Trade Union representatives
- All other special school head teachers
- Gorgie Mills Special School (secondary)
 - Parents /carers
 - Pupils
 - Staff
 - Parent Council
 - Potential parents
- Edinburgh's mainstream secondary schools

¹²Published April 2016 (<https://education.gov.scot/reports/edinburgh-city/1002945>)
Page 26 of 28

- Secondary school head teachers
 - Pupil support deputy head teachers (responsible for managing CMRG referrals within their own school)
 - Parents/carers
- Parent Council chairs for all Edinburgh secondary schools and the special sector
 - Edinburgh councillors /representatives (Education, Children and Families Committee)
 - Archdiocese of St Andrews /Archdiocese of Edinburgh
 - Tollcross and Southside Community Councils

10.3 The consultation period will run for a minimum of 6 weeks (including 30 days of school term time) i.e. from 10 January 2017 to 27 February 2017.

10.4 The consultation document will be made available electronically and in paper format. A public meeting will be held in respect of the proposal at the venues listed below.

Venue	Date	Time
Waverley Court (Room C.47) 4 East Market Street Edinburgh EH8 8BG	Monday 6 February 2017	6.00pm- 8.00pm

10.5 At the end of the consultation period, the Council will provide Education Scotland with a copy of this document; written representations received by the authority during the consultation period (or, if agreed, a summary of representations) and a record of the public meetings.

10.6 Education Scotland is required to prepare a report on the educational aspects of the relevant proposals and must submit this report to the Council within three weeks (or longer if agreed). It is anticipated that their assessment would be undertaken during March 2017. The Council must then take account of this report in preparing the Consultation Report on the outcomes of the consultation.

10.7 This Consultation Report must be publicly available at least three weeks prior to its consideration by Council and notification will be given to those individuals or groups that have made representations during the consultation period. The report will include a summary of written representations received during the

consultation period and representations made at the public meetings along with the Council response to representations made. It is anticipated that the consultation report will be presented to a meeting of the Council on 29 May 2017 setting out final recommendations.

10.8 Should the Council approve the closure of Panmure St Ann's School, then Scottish Ministers would have six weeks from the date of the Council decision to decide whether to call in the proposal for determination. Should Scottish Ministers decide not to call in the proposal, the Council could enact the decision. Based on a Council decision being taken on 29 May 2017, the Ministerial call in period (maximum of 8 weeks from the final Council decision, if closure, would conclude on 4 August 2017).

10.9 The Council website, www.edinburgh.gov.uk/panmureconsultation will contain information on the consultation. During the consultation period, any views on this proposal should be sent in writing to the address given below. Responses can also be made by e-mail to panmurestanns.consultation@edinburgh.gov.uk

All responses to the consultation paper should be received by 27 February 2017 and addressed to the Acting Executive Director of Communities and Families.

Alastair Gaw

Acting Executive Director of Communities and Families

The City of Edinburgh Council

Waverley Court

Business Centre 2.6

(Panmure St Ann's consultation)

4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG



HAPPY TO TRANSLATE

ترجمہ کے لئے ہمیں خوش ہے
আমাদের সঙ্গে অনুবাদ করব
بِسْمِ اللَّهِ تَوَفَّرُ التَّرْجُمةُ
MOŻEMY PRZETŁUMACZYĆ
很樂意翻譯

You can get this document on tape, in Braille, large print and various computer formats if you ask us. Please contact Interpretation and Translation Service (ITS) on 0131 242 8181 and quote reference number 17-1003.

ITS can also give information on community language translations.

You can get more copies of this document by calling Children's Services Business Support on 0131 469 6123 or email your request to:

Panmurestanns.consultation@edinburgh.gov.uk